

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Period: \_\_\_\_\_

Evaluate two essays. Compare them to your own. Answer all questions completely.

**Essay #1:** Answer the following questions.

Does the essay contain...

...an effective attention getter? \_\_\_\_\_ ...enough background information? \_\_\_\_\_

Does this essay restate and answer the question in a clearly stated thesis sentence? \_\_\_\_\_

If so, what is the thesis sentence? If not, what should it be? \_\_\_\_\_

Does all quoted textual evidence actually work to support the thesis rather than just fill space? \_\_\_\_\_

Are sources cited for all quotations and textual evidence? \_\_\_\_\_

Is all quoted textual evidence short and appropriate? \_\_\_\_\_

Is there at least twice as much elaboration and/or explanation (writer's reasoning)? \_\_\_\_\_

Is the essay organized in a sensible way? \_\_\_\_\_ Is it an academic essay? \_\_\_\_\_

Do paragraphs cover different aspects of the topic? \_\_\_\_\_ Does each have a topic sentence? \_\_\_\_\_

Does the writing include appropriate transitional words and phrases? \_\_\_\_\_

Does the writer **avoid**...

...being a Bubba ("I am going to tell you...", "Some textual evidence that supports this is...")? \_\_\_\_\_

Does the writer **avoid**...

...too much copying/pasting? \_\_\_\_\_

...starting all sentences the same way? \_\_\_\_\_

...writing all sentences about the same length? \_\_\_\_\_

...using the same words or phrasing over and over? \_\_\_\_\_

Is the vocabulary age-appropriate and natural sounding throughout the paper? \_\_\_\_\_

Does there appear to be any plagiarism in the essay? \_\_\_\_\_

Does it sound like the work/voice/vocabulary of a ninth grader? \_\_\_\_\_

Are there quotes that are not accompanied by any elaboration/explanation? \_\_\_\_\_

What does the plagiarism checker indicate? \_\_\_\_\_

Is this essay better or worse than the one you wrote on the same topic? \_\_\_\_\_

Why? \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

**Essay #2:** Circle the appropriate number in each category.

**FOCUS** – The response is **fully** sustained and **consistently** and **purposefully** focused.

**Clearly** introduces the topic; addresses all aspects of the prompt appropriately; demonstrates understanding of the topic and text(s).

4 (**excellent**)      3 (**adequate**)      2 (**insufficient**)      1 (**minimal**)      0 (**incoherent**)

**ORGANIZATION** – The response has a **clear** and **effective** organizational structure.

Organizes complex ideas, concepts, and information; consistently and effectively uses appropriate and varied transitions in and among paragraphs to link the major sections of the text and create cohesion; provides an effective concluding statement or section that supports the topic.

4 (**excellent**)      3 (**adequate**)      2 (**insufficient**)      1 (**minimal**)      0 (**incoherent**)

**EVIDENCE** –The response provides thorough and convincing evidence to the claim.

**Thoroughly** develops the topic with well-chosen, relevant, and sufficient facts, extended definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples appropriate to the topic.

4 (**excellent**)      3 (**adequate**)      2 (**insufficient**)      1 (**minimal**)      0 (**incoherent**)

**ELABORATION** – The response achieves **substantial** depth by using precise language and elaborative techniques:

Explanation; analysis; figurative language, relationships; real world examples; prediction; inference.

**Effective** use of precise language and vocabulary to manage the topic.

4 (**excellent**)      3 (**adequate**)      2 (**insufficient**)      1 (**minimal**)      0 (**incoherent**)

**CONVENTIONS** – The response demonstrates an **adequate** command of conventions:

Some errors in usage and sentence formation may be present, but no systematic pattern of errors; adequate use of punctuation, capitalization, and spelling.

2 (**adequate**)      1 (**obscure/inconsistent**)      0 (**incoherent**)

Total \_\_\_\_\_/14

The total is out of 14 because that is the minimum score required for PROFICIENCY.

Now look at your own essay on the same topic. What score would it receive? \_\_\_\_\_/14

Why? \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_